

a high concentration of Spiritists whose beliefs threaten the established Catholic dogmas. However, when he uses parapsychological evidence of certain phenomena as a scientific backup to establish facts, when this same evidence is still very controversial for many parapsychologists, his position is untenable. Nonetheless, his work has to be seen in the cultural and ideological background from which he has worked (Alvarado, 1991).

Another dimension of Brazilian psychical research is the work by researchers with Spiritist orientation. One example is that conducted by the engineer and psychical researcher Hernani Guimarães Andrade, who in 1963 founded the Brazilian Institute of Psychobiophysical Research (IBPP). The name was chosen to make it clear that the Institute intended to explore biological and physical as well as purely psychical phenomena. One of the most significant things about this Institute is that it emerged from within the Spiritist movement (Playfair, 1975). Andrade, a Spiritist himself, has conducted well-planned and detailed investigations of reincarnation cases along the lines of Ian Stevenson's work. His poltergeist cases are particularly interesting—for example, the one published in a monograph entitled *O Poltergeist de Guarulhos* (1984). These cases involve very dramatic phenomena: apoplexies, damage to furniture and persons, apparitions of strange creatures, and spontaneous fires. In evaluating and interpreting the cases, Andrade leans toward the discarnate agencies hypothesis, sometimes with possible witchcraft components (Alvarado, 1984b; Andrade, 1984). Also, as Michel-Ange Amorim (1990) has remarked about Andrade's interpretation of the cases:

Andrade interprets the different types of occurrences present in this case [the Guarulhos's case] as supportive of a Spiritist world view in the Umbanda tradition. The Umbanda tradition has several million adherents especially in the bigger cities. It combines African, Catholic, Indian, and Spiritist elements and may be characterized as a relatively extra-ecclesiastic of popular Catholicism with ancient Afro-Brazilian sects. (p. 199)

According to Amorim, not only does Andrade interpret his cases along the Spiritist lines but he also accepts the central beliefs of this religion, such as the existence of all sorts of spirits, like *axus* and *Umulums*. He also believes that the sorcerer is able to practice magic within the *terreiros* (a place specialized in these procedures) to harass victims according to Quimbanda laws (the black magic side of the Umbanda religion).

Concerning Andrade's interpretation of the aforementioned case of Guarulhos, Amorim (1990) also states:

Thus, he rejects the usual attributions of RSPK outbreaks to a living agency. In defense of his position he points to the fact that a psychological examination of Noêmia [a participant in the case], the most probable RSPK agent, was conducted by two psychologists belonging to the IBPP team. He states, "Mrs. Noêmia didn't display any form of psychical abnormality that could justify viewing her as belonging to the 'psychokinetic agent of a poltergeist' category in conformity with the theoretical patterns suggested by the current hypothesis". . . He adds that his medium-RPK tests . . . of her capacities were also negative. (p. 199)

It is important, however, to point out that to some extent the cases investigated by Andrade and his associates seem to reflect the influence of the beliefs and culture of Brazilian society (Hess, 1990). Andrade has also published one of the first systematic treatises of parapsychology in Portuguese entitled *Parapsicologia Experimental* (1967). A basic introductory manual of the quantitative method used in parapsychology, it includes a detailed description of the statistical model used in experiments with ESP cards.

There are other groups in Brazil who are interested in a more scientific approach to psychical research. One of these groups is the recently established ECLHESY-Instituto de Investigações Científicas em Parapsicologia. This group aims to pursue a different approach, one separate from the more traditional approaches associated with Spiritist or Catholic orientations typical of most Brazilian research centers. It received support from the University of São Francisco to organize its first conference in parapsychology, held in 1990, which included participants from the University as well as researchers from Argentina, Brazil, and Mexico. The group plans to conduct experimental research that will be reported in its new journal, called *Revista Brasileira de Parapsicologia*. According to its president, Wellington Zangari, it will include abstracts in English as well as in Spanish. The journal will also include translations from major experimental and theoretical articles published in the English-language journals.

There are also other groups involved in parapsychology in Brazil that are beyond the scope of this paper because of limitations of space and because of our initial goal of evaluating Brazilian parapsychology from the perspective of its impact on the Ibero-American countries.

Argentina

For many years Argentina has been the top-ranking country in Ibero-America in terms of experimental parapsychological research.

However, research has diminished in the last few years, partly because of the recent deaths of two of the leading contributors, J. Ricardo Musso and Enrique Novillo Pauli.

Early research began in Argentina about the same time the Duke University Laboratory was established in the United States. The 1930s witnessed one of the most important events in the history of Argentine parapsychology. In 1931, the first institute of psychology was established at the University of Buenos Aires. The institute included paranormal psychology as one of the areas to be investigated by the department. Parapsychology appeared to be joined to psychology from the beginning. The chairman of the psychology department, Enrique Mouchet, was interested in clairvoyance research and had come to the conclusion that it was necessary to include paranormal psychology in the syllabus of courses offered by the department (Musso, 1973).

However, Argentinian researchers have had to struggle with the traditional spiritualistic methodology that characterized the study of psychical research in this country in the past. The research being conducted in the young Duke Parapsychology Laboratory had a major impact on the new generation of Argentinian researchers. The move toward a more quantitative approach to the study of scientific parapsychology was pioneered by a young engineer by the name of José Fernández, who was teaching physics at the University of Buenos Aires. Although Fernández belonged to a Spiritualist group called ATMAN, he had been in search of an adequate methodology to investigate the psychic phenomena manifested by mediums and clairvoyants. He hoped to be able to apply statistical principles to the responses given by the mediums. Fernández presented the results of these experiments in 1941 to a meeting of the Sociedad Científica Argentina. Fernández's efforts to introduce quantitative methodology in Argentina had a major impact on the approaches that other young researchers were to follow in establishing scientific parapsychology there.

Another development during this period was the creation of the Asociación Argentina Médica de Metapsíquica in 1946 by a group of physicians headed by Orlando Canavesio. The aim of this society was to evaluate the medical and legal status of parapsychology scientifically and to promote its development in scientific circles as well as to determine its proper classification, that is, to decide whether the discipline belonged to psychology or physiology, or whether it could be considered to be a new branch of science.

Canavesio himself wrote his doctoral thesis on a study of electroencephalographic records of gifted subjects. This society pub-

lished a journal called *Revista Médica de Metapsíquica* summarizing the research of the society. Included among the articles published in the journal was a study of the use of dowsers by the government to find water in towns where the lack of water had become a hardship for its inhabitants. During this period, the work of Canavesio was important because of his connection to the government, a connection that helped to legitimize parapsychological studies in Argentina (Musso, 1973).

The creation of the Instituto de Psicopatología Aplicada in 1948 by the Secretary of Public Health was another important development. The aim of the government was to establish tight control over the Spiritist activities in Argentina, which were considered to be a social evil. More specifically, the aim was to control the exploitation of people engaged in nonscientific practices such as healing, and so on.

The Institute created a subsidiary, the Comité de Investigaciones Metapsíquicas, which was assigned to conduct experimental research with gifted subjects, specifically during mediumistic sessions. The Committee intended to explore the medical and legal implications of Spiritist practices, as well as to determine whether genuine parapsychological phenomena were exhibited during these sessions by the gifted subjects. The Committee was also interested in uncovering negative factors that might induce mental illness, such as neurosis, in the participants. More specifically, it seems that the real objective of the Committee was to determine whether the promoters of these mediumistic sessions were practicing medicine illegally (Parra, 1989).

In 1949 José Fernández founded the Sociedad Argentina de Parapsicología. Fernández, who was already known for his quantitative approach to psychic phenomena, continued to promote the statistical approach used by the Duke researchers. This approach was reflected in the Society's main objective, which was to study and investigate parapsychological phenomena with emphasis on the development of statistical methods. By then Fernández had received from Rhine a copy of *Extra-Sensory Perception After Sixty Years* (Pratt, Rhine, Smith, Stuart, & Greenwood, 1940). The book had a major impact on Fernández, who applied Rhine's mathematical models to his own research. Fernández also circulated the book among his friends (Musso, 1973).

The Society conducted the first serious experiments on clairvoyance in Argentina using ESP cards and statistical procedures. The study, with gifted subjects, obtained significant results. Fernández presented the results of these experiments in a pamphlet entitled

Psicología Experimental. The Society also conducted other experiments such as the one with the well-known clairvoyant Conrado Castiglione. The study used the empty-chair technique similar to that used with Ludwig Khan and with Gerard Croiset (Musso, 1973).

The first Instituto Argentino de Parapsicología was established in 1953. It brought together several men who represented the most critical approach of the time, men such as José Fernández, Orlando Canavesio, J. Ricardo Musso, and Naum Kreiman. The Institute was organized to include a main scientific research department, along with several sections, such as the medical-biological section and a physics and mathematics section. The principles of the Institute reflected the critical approach their members followed in conducting their research. One of these was to subject every hypothesis to scientific examination, so that only those that would withstand the most stringent tests would remain. In addition to the creation of the Institute, this period of the 1950s was also characterized by a growing interest in publishing books on parapsychology. One of the first systematic treatises on parapsychology in Spanish written by J. Ricardo Musso (1954) was called *En los Límites de la Psicología: Desde el Espiritismo hasta la Parapsicología* [On the Limits of Psychology: From Spiritualism to Parapsychology]. Other developments included a paper by Musso in 1957, which was published in a journal put out by the ministry of education of the province of Buenos Aires. It was the first time a paper on parapsychology had been published in a government review. In addition, parapsychology was incorporated as a course in five different universities. In 1960, Ricardo Musso was awarded a professorship at Rosario University to teach parapsychology, and, for the first time in any country, a course in parapsychology was made a requirement for a doctoral degree in psychology (Rueda, 1989).

In 1962 the Institute conducted studies confirming the sheep-goat effect, using primary-school children as subjects. The results were published in the *Journal of Parapsychology* (Musso, 1965). Other important experiments included "An ESP Drawing Experiment with a High Scoring Subject," also published in the *Journal of Parapsychology* (Musso & Granero, 1973). Moreover, Musso and his wife and colleague, Mirta Granero, conducted an international experiment on long-distance ESP called the "Antarctic Experiment." Although the results were not statistically significant they were important because the experiment involved subjects from twenty different countries (Musso, 1973, p. 168).

The expansion period of parapsychology was interrupted in 1966 when the then current Argentinian government was over-

thrown by a military coup; most state universities were forced to eliminate the study from their curricula. In spite of the prevailing negative conditions standing in the way of university status for the subject, a new quarterly publication was founded. The *Cuadernos de Parapsicología*, perhaps the most important publication in the history of Argentinian experimental parapsychology, took the responsibility of disseminating a high level of academic parapsychology. Headed by Naum Kreiman, it has been the most professional organ of scientific parapsychology in Argentina to the present time.

Owing to the military takeover of the government that eliminated most of the parapsychology courses offered at the state universities, parapsychology did not enjoy the same status at the beginning of the 1970s as it had during the period of university expansion of the 1960s. Some new developments during this period kept the torch lit, however. Among the most important ones was the creation of the Instituto de Parapsicología in 1970. It is headed by Naum Kreiman, a bio-statistician and a co-founder of the Instituto Argentino de Parapsicología in the 1950s. Kreiman has played a key role in the development of the quantitative approach to the study of parapsychology for the last 30 years. From 1964 to the present he has conducted numerous original experiments as well as replications of some of the most important experiments conducted in foreign countries. With the help of his wife and collaborator, Dora Ivinsky, and Ladislao Márquez, he has conducted numerous experiments that have been published in the *Cuadernos*. Among them are exploratory testing with ESP cards (Kreiman & Ivinsky, 1964); ESP using photographs as targets (Kreiman, 1965); the sheep-goat effect in ESP (Kreiman, 1972); the effect of feedback on ESP (Kreiman & Ivinsky, 1973); ESP and memory (Kreiman, 1975); memory and precognition (Kreiman, 1978); psi and volition (Kreiman & Ivinsky, 1980); brain laterality and ESP (Kreiman, 1981); precognition of human actions (Ivinsky & Kreiman, 1981); and remote viewing (Kreiman, 1983).

Institute members such as Dora Ivinsky have done extensive work in keeping the Argentinian parapsychological community informed of activities around the world by translating numerous experiments and theoretical papers from languages other than Spanish from the *Journal of Parapsychology* and elsewhere. The diligent experimental work done by Kreiman since the 1950s and continuing to the present time makes him one of the most important laboratory researchers in Argentinian and Ibero-American parapsychology.

Another important development during this period was the creation of an Institute of Parapsychology at the Catholic University of

Córdoba by the Catholic priest Enrique Novillo Paulí. One of the principal activities of the Institute was to teach courses on parapsychology in the school of psychology at the University. The staff of the Institute also provided consultation and orientation to bishops, priests, and families about phenomena such as poltergeists and bleeding religious images. Unfortunately this institute recently closed down after the death of Father Novillo.

Prior to the creation of the Institute, Novillo Paulí had been at the Foundation for Research on the Nature of Man in North Carolina where he conducted some PK research with seeds as targets under the auspices of the Organization of American States. Novillo Paulí presented the results of his experiments at the annual convention of the Parapsychological Association in 1972 (Novillo Paulí, 1973). During the period of his stay at the FRNM, he also prepared a book on parapsychology entitled *Los Fenómenos Parapsicológicos: Psi en el Laboratorio* (1975), which included reports of his PK studies. The studies were also reported in the Spanish-language parapsychological journals *Cuadernos de Parapsicología* (1974) and *Psi Comunicación* (1976).

In spite of the marked decline since the 1970s, an important recent development is the organization of a parapsychology conference in Argentina in 1987, the Primer Encuentro de Parapsicología. It was sponsored by the University of Salvador of Buenos Aires and held under the direction of Enrique Novillo Paulí. Some of the topics discussed at the conference were mental healing studies, altered states of consciousness in relation to psi performance, and quantum mechanics (Alvarado, 1989b). Soon afterward, Argentina suffered the loss of two of its most important pioneers, J. Ricardo Musso, president of the Instituto Argentino de Parapsicología (which he directed until his death in 1989) and, in the same year, Enrique Novillo Paulí. Consequently, the activities of Musso's institute declined, and the institute at the University of El Salvador headed by Enrique Novillo Paulí closed down. Since then, the Institute of Parapsychology headed by Kreiman has remained as the most important source of professional parapsychology in Argentina.

During the 1980s, parapsychology in Argentina was characterized by a marked decline in experimental activities. Most of the work during this period was conducted by members of the Institute of Parapsychology under Kreiman, who, as in previous years, maintained a constant interest in reporting original experiments, including replications of foreign experimental works. They also continued to publish regularly their quarterly journal, which contained translations of some of the most important research published in English.

Recently, a new parapsychology journal, the *Revista Argentina de Psicología Paranormal*, has appeared. It is published by an independent group of parapsychologists called LAPAS (Laboratory of Parapsychology) and edited mainly by Alejandro Parra. Judged by its content, the journal seems to be a worthwhile addition to the current efforts to keep the Argentinian audience well informed on professional parapsychology. However, some of the experiments of the researchers in this group have not been well received by other Argentinian researchers, who consider the experiments to be flawed (Kreiman, 1990; see also Alvarado, 1990). LAPAS has also started a Spanish-language parapsychology information center. The Center is building a computer data bank from which Spanish-speaking parapsychologists may obtain information about a bibliography on parapsychology similar to the *Parapsychology International Abstracts* published by Rhea White (Villanueva, 1990).

In addition to these recent developments, CSICOP has made its way to Argentina. A former member of Naum Kreiman's research group, Ladislao Márquez, has created an Argentinian version called Centro Argentino Para la Investigación y Refutación de la Pseudociencia (CAIRP). The most important aims of CAIRP are to denounce fraud and to promote a critical scientific assessment of the claims made by pseudoscientists. The board of directors, headed by Ladislao Márquez, also includes foreign members, Martin Gardner, for instance.

The prospects for Argentinian parapsychology in the 1990s seem less favorable than those of the booming period of previous years. The present difficulties in the Argentinian economy have increased for researchers, making it difficult for them to obtain funds to support their research and publications.

In a recent survey conducted on the present status of parapsychology in Argentina, Naum Kreiman reported that research has decreased substantially over the last five years. Most of the recent research reports have come from Kreiman's Institute of Parapsychology. Educational activities in the field are almost nil except for a course being offered at a small university called John F. Kennedy University (Kreiman & Ivinsky, 1989).

In a letter published in the *Journal of Parapsychology*, Jorge Villanueva (1990) pointed out some of the major problems that Argentinian researchers face at the present time. Among them are lack of support from public and private institutions, lack of serious books in Spanish to provide responsible information on the subject, and lack of proper technology and other means to conduct sophisticated research. Some of these problems, Villanueva suggests, may be di-

minished by increasing communication and collaboration with foreign parapsychologists.

← Puerto Rico¹⁰

Early psychical research in Puerto Rico was strongly influenced by the nineteenth-century Spiritualist movement that had also spread to other countries. Mediumistic séances in which raps and communication with the spirits were common drew attention mostly from people with a religious interest.

It was perhaps this influence that led Agapito Morales to publish in 1904 a more critical examination of these phenomena. In his booklet *Breve Tratado de Hipnotismo, Magnetismo, Espiritismo y Sugestoterapia*, Morales contended that all those occurrences could take place without assuming the action of spirit agencies. He interpreted possession as being autosuggestion and attributed paranormal phenomena to our own psychic faculties. He considered that all of the experiments made until today demonstrate that there is an invisible force in our being that is capable, for instance, of playing a guitar, lifting a table, or lifting our own bodies. According to him this force is under our control. He also believed that mediumistic communication could be explained by means of telepathy between the medium and the sitter.

Another major influence in the formation of a more empirical and critical approach to parapsychology was the work of Francisco Ponte, a dentist who became president of the Puerto Rican Federation of Spiritists. Ponte visited Europe in 1912 to familiarize himself with the work of several Spiritualistic centers, as well as psychical research centers. He had had the opportunity to participate in mediumistic séances in Italy with famous mediums such as Lucia Sordi and Eusapia Palladino. During these séances he witnessed manifestations of apparent telekinesis and materializations (Alvarado, 1987; Ponte, 1914).

Later Ponte returned to Puerto Rico and tried to reproduce the same phenomena with local mediums. He reported some of his findings on materializations of body parts during séances to Walter Franklin Prince, then Research Officer of the ASPR. Ponte's work was important because of the critical and empirical approach he brought to his research on séance phenomena (Alvarado, 1979a).

¹⁰ This section on Puerto Rican parapsychology partly summarizes information contained in an article by Alvarado (1979a).

The theoretical ideas of Ralph U. Sierra are also interesting. Sierra, who was interested in the psychology of ESP, believed that to develop telepathy it was necessary to develop first an internal state of tranquility so that the electrical activity of the brain did not interfere with the telepathic process (Sierra, 1966).

Some of the most important developments, however, took place during the last two centuries. At the educational level, it is important to note the work of Celinda Madera who, during the 1970s, offered a series of courses and lectures at different campuses of the University of Puerto Rico. Madera's courses focused on the humanistic and transpersonal aspects of psi. She herself had received training at Duke University's Parapsychology Laboratory (Alvarado, 1979a).

In 1974, Nestor A. Rodríguez Escudero, a lawyer, published a series of essays about parapsychology and Spiritualism in his book *Los Caminos de Dios*. He discussed a great variety of paranormal phenomena. His main objective was to show that parapsychology demonstrates the spiritual aspect of man (Rodríguez Escudero, 1974).

Another development in 1977 was the creation of the Instituto de Investigaciones Psico físicas at the University of Puerto Rico, Mayagüez campus. Founded to conduct investigations in parapsychology and related areas, the Institute carried out studies of various parameters of Kirlian photography and of the effects of hypnosis on ESP. However, these research investigations were never made available for publication. During this period Alfonso Martínez Taboas began to publish a newsletter *Explorando lo Paranormal*, a semipopular magazine later edited by Carlos Alvarado starting in 1976.

Martínez Taboas and Carlos Alvarado wrote articles on parapsychology in Spanish for the Spanish journal *Psi Comunicación*; they also published in other journals. Their articles covered a wide range of topics. Among these, Alvarado wrote on experimental studies of OBEs (1976), historical precedents of the so-called psychic discoveries behind the Iron Curtain (1978), the use of historical knowledge (1979b), and on J. B. Rhine (1980). Martínez Taboas published a review of the problem of repeatability in parapsychology (1979), critiques of psychological and physiological concepts of poltergeist research (1977, 1980, 1984; Martínez Taboas & Alvarado, 1981), and a discussion of the concept of parsimony applied to parapsychology (1983).

The work of Martínez Taboas and Alvarado has been very important in the effort to bridge the language barrier between the Spanish researcher and the non-Spanish-speaking researcher. This